

Referee Report for “On Vince Vatter’s Brilliant Extension of Doron Zeilberger’s Enumeration Schemes for Herb Wilf’s Classes”

Lara Pudwell

Overall this paper is nicely written and explains the concept of the enumeration schemes well. I found the choice of examples throughout very helpful. There are only a few minor corrections to be made. See below:

- In the definition of reduction on page 2, it should read “then the i^{th} -smallest entry...” (instead of i^{th} largest).
- In the examples of reduction on page 2, were the Greek letters intentional? English letters or another example with numbers as letters could be more instructive for many readers.
- In both sets of examples of pattern avoidance on page 4, you switch from discussing the permutation 54321 to the pattern 45321. The two mentions of 54321 should be changed accordingly.
- The list of unfortunate events at the top of page 6 is missing the unfortunate event $[\{1, 2, 3\}, 2134]$.
- At the bottom of page 6, I am unsure where the i 's appeared from. In both the sentence that begins “We know that the reduction of $i_{\pi_{r_1}} \dots$ ” and the centered line below it, I think it should just read $\pi_{r_1}, \dots, \pi_{r_s}$ instead.
- In the second paragraph of page 9, you say “for *every* unfortunate event $[p = p_1 \dots p_s \dots p_a, S], \dots$ ”. This should really say $[S, p = p_1 \dots p_s \dots p_a]$ to be consistent with earlier notation.
- Also on page 9, you may want to remind readers that s is the number of elements of S to make the indexing clear.